

Inquiry into Pediatric Forensic Pathology in Ontario

R E P O R T

Volume 4: Inquiry Process

The Honourable Stephen T. Goudge
Commissioner

Published by the Ontario Ministry of the Attorney General
© Queen's Printer for Ontario 2008

ISBN 978-1-4249-7792-5 (Print) (set)
ISBN 978-1-4249-7799-4 (Print) (v. 4)
ISBN 978-1-4249-7800-7 (PDF) (v. 4)

Copies of this and other Ontario Government publications are available from Publications Ontario at ServiceOntario Centre, College Park Building, 777 Bay Street at College, Toronto M5G 2E5. Out-of-town customers may write to Publications Ontario, 50 Grosvenor Street, Toronto M7A 1N8. Telephone (416) 326-5300; (416) 325-3408 TTY; or toll-free 1-800-668-9938 or 1-800-268-7095 TTY. Internet: www.publications.serviceontario.ca.

This Report is also available at www.goudgeinquiry.ca for one year following publication, and, thereafter, at www.attorneygeneral.jus.gov.on.ca

Disponible en français

LIBRARY AND ARCHIVES CANADA CATALOGUING IN PUBLICATION DATA

Inquiry into Pediatric Forensic Pathology in Ontario

Inquiry into Pediatric Forensic Pathology in Ontario report
[electronic resource]

Issued also in French under title: Rapport de la Commission
d'enquête sur la médecine légale pédiatrique en Ontario.

Includes bibliographical references.

Electronic monograph in PDF format.

Available also in printed form.

ISBN 978-1-4249-7794-9 (v. 1)

978-1-4249-7796-3 (v. 2)

978-1-4249-7798-7 (v. 3)

978-1-4249-7800-7 (v. 4)

1. Forensic pathology—Ontario. 2. Forensic pathology. 3. Pediatric pathology. 4. Medical jurisprudence. 5. Child abuse—Investigation—Ontario. 6. Criminal justice, Administration of—Ontario. 7. Child welfare—Ontario. I. Title. II. Title: Rapport de la Commission d'enquête sur la médecine légale pédiatrique en Ontario.

RA1063.4 I57 2008 614'.108309713 C2008-964036-5

Contents

Volume 1: Executive Summary

Volume 2: Systemic Review

Acknowledgments xv

Abbreviations and Acronyms xvii

Glossary of Medical Terms xix

- 1 The Death of a Child and the Criminal Justice System 3
- 2 Growing Concerns 7
- 3 Establishment of the Commission 44
- 4 Investigation of Suspicious Pediatric Deaths 51
- 5 Legislative Context 60
- 6 The Science and Culture of Forensic Pathology 66
- 7 Organization of Pediatric Forensic Pathology 80
- 8 Dr. Smith and the Practice of Pediatric Forensic Pathology 115
- 9 Oversight of Pediatric Forensic Pathology 205

Volume 3: Policy and Recommendations

Abbreviations and Acronyms xiii

Glossary of Medical Terms xv

- 10 Restoring Confidence in Pediatric Forensic Pathology 281
- 11 Professionalizing and Rebuilding Pediatric Forensic Pathology 284
- 12 Reorganizing Pediatric Forensic Pathology 308
- 13 Enhancing Oversight and Accountability 331
- 14 Improving the Complaints Process 363
- 15 Best Practices 372
- 16 Effective Communication with the Criminal Justice System 406
- 17 The Roles of Coroners, Police, Crown, and Defence 437

- 18 The Role of the Court 470
- 19 Pediatric Forensic Pathology and Potential Wrongful Convictions 514
- 20 First Nations and Remote Communities 546
- 21 Pediatric Forensic Pathology and Families 567
- 22 Conclusion and Consolidated Recommendations 588

Volume 4: Inquiry Process

- 23 The Scope and Approach of the Inquiry 635
 - The Principles of the Inquiry Process 635
 - Setting Up the Inquiry 637
 - Staff 637
 - Administrative Staff 637
 - Commission Counsel and Staff Lawyers 637
 - Policy and Research Staff 638
 - Communications and Media Relations Officer 638
 - Counselling and Outreach Manager 638
 - Document Manager and Counselling and Outreach Coordinator 639
 - Infrastructure 639
 - Offices / Hearing Room 639
 - Communications 640
 - Affected Individuals 640
 - Private Consultations 640
 - Counselling 642
 - Standing and Funding 643
 - Applications for Standing 644
 - Applications 644
 - Oral Submissions 645
 - Decision on Standing and Funding 645
 - Subsequent Applications 647
 - Rights of Parties with Standing 647
 - Rules of Procedure 648
 - Investigation 649
 - Document Production 649
 - Practical Challenges 650
 - Confidentiality Undertakings 652
 - Distribution of Documents 653
 - Conclusion 654
 - Witness Interviews 654
 - Notices of Alleged Misconduct 656

The Review Panel	657
Privacy Issues	657
Education and Consultation	659
Pathology Seminars	659
Visits	660
Institutional Visits	660
Visits to First Nations Communities	660
Systemic Issues List	661
All-Counsel Meetings and Motions	662
All-Counsel Meeting on the Hearing Process	662
Motions	662
Overview Reports	663
Institutional Reports	665
Hearings	666
Documentary Evidence	667
Oral Evidence	668
Time Limits for Examination and Cross-Examination	668
Panels	669
Cross-Examination	670
Dr. Smith's Evidence	670
Questions from the Commissioner	671
Conclusion	671
Roundtables	671
Submissions	672
Parties	672
Non-Parties	673
The Delivery Date for the Report	673
Research	674
Conclusion	674

Appendices

1	Order in Council	677
2	Amendment to Order in Council	682
3	Hearing Room Seating Plan	683
4	Backgrounder: Public Announcement of Review of Criminally Suspicious and Homicide Cases Where Dr. Charles Smith Conducted Autopsies or Provided Opinions: April 19, 2007	684

5	Commissioner’s Opening Statement: June 18, 2007	691
6	Rules of Standing and Funding	708
7	Press Releases:	711
	May 24, 2007	711
	June 11, 2007	713
8	Ruling on Standing and Funding: August 17, 2007	715
9	Supplementary Ruling on Funding: October 2, 2007	730
10	Ruling on Standing and Funding: August 22, 2007	734
11	Ruling on Application for Standing by the College of Physicians and Surgeons of Ontario: October 17, 2007	737
12	Ruling on the Application for Standing by Marco Trotta: November 5, 2007	739
13	Ruling on the Application for Standing by Two Individuals: November 6, 2007	742
14	Ruling on the Application for Standing by Two Individuals: January 8, 2008	744
15	Rules of Procedure	746
16	Ruling on the Motion for Directions by the College of Physicians and Surgeons of Ontario: October 10, 2007	752
17	Ruling by the Associate Chief Justice of Ontario on the Kingston Police Service Motion Asserting Privilege over Certain Documents: November 20, 2007	768
18	Confidentiality Undertaking of Counsel	781
19	Third Party Confidentiality Agreement	785
20	Sample Notice of Alleged Misconduct	789
21	Ontario Court of Justice – Youth Court: Orders (S.M. and J.D.)	791
22	Ruling on the Requests for Non-Publication Orders: November 1, 2007	795
23	List of Systemic Issues: November 20, 2007	810
24	Ruling on the Application by Dr. Charles Smith to Be Examined in Chief by his Own Counsel: November 20, 2007	820
25	Ruling on Motion to Recall Dr. James Young: February 8, 2008	824
26	Ruling on Motion to Make Oral Submissions: March 31, 2008	826
27	Sample Overview Report	828
28	Overview of the 20 Cases	953
29	Policy Roundtables: Participants and Issues	963
30	Memorandum to Parties with Standing from Linda Rothstein, Commission Counsel: February 20, 2008	978
31	List of Appearances	981
32	List of Witnesses	983
	Commissioner and Inquiry Staff	985