

Inquiry into Pediatric Forensic Pathology in Ontario

R E P O R T

Volume 2: Systemic Review

The Honourable Stephen T. Goudge
Commissioner

Published by the Ontario Ministry of the Attorney General
© Queen's Printer for Ontario 2008

ISBN 978-1-4249-7792-5 (Print) (set)
ISBN 978-1-4249-7795-6 (Print) (v. 2)
ISBN 978-1-4249-7796-3 (PDF) (v. 2)

Copies of this and other Ontario Government publications are available from Publications Ontario at ServiceOntario Centre, College Park Building, 777 Bay Street at College, Toronto M5G 2E5. Out-of-town customers may write to Publications Ontario, 50 Grosvenor Street, Toronto M7A 1N8. Telephone (416) 326-5300; (416) 325-3408 TTY; or toll-free 1-800-668-9938 or 1-800-268-7095 TTY. Internet: www.publications.serviceontario.ca.

This Report is also available at www.goudgeinquiry.ca for one year following publication, and, thereafter, at www.attorneygeneral.jus.gov.on.ca.

Disponible en français

LIBRARY AND ARCHIVES CANADA CATALOGUING IN PUBLICATION DATA

Inquiry into Pediatric Forensic Pathology in Ontario

Inquiry into Pediatric Forensic Pathology in Ontario report
[electronic resource]

Issued also in French under title: Rapport de la Commission
d'enquête sur la médecine légale pédiatrique en Ontario.

Includes bibliographical references.

Electronic monograph in PDF format.

Available also in printed form.

ISBN 978-1-4249-7794-9 (v. 1)

978-1-4249-7796-3 (v. 2)

978-1-4249-7798-7 (v. 3)

978-1-4249-7800-7 (v. 4)

1. Forensic pathology—Ontario. 2. Forensic pathology. 3. Pediatric pathology. 4. Medical jurisprudence. 5. Child abuse—Investigation—Ontario. 6. Criminal justice, Administration of—Ontario. 7. Child welfare—Ontario. I. Title. II. Title: Rapport de la Commission d'enquête sur la médecine légale pédiatrique en Ontario.

RA1063.4 I57 2008 614'.108309713 C2008-964036-5

Contents

Volume 1: Executive Summary

Volume 2: Systemic Review

Acknowledgments xv

Abbreviations and Acronyms xvii

Glossary of Medical Terms xix

1 The Death of a Child and the Criminal Justice System 3

2 Growing Concerns 7

The Key Participants 8

Causes of Growing Concerns 11

Amber's Case 11

Nicholas' Case 14

Jenna's Case 18

Sharon's Case 22

Athena's Case 26

Valin's Case 27

The Chief Coroner's Review 32

The Review Parameters 33

The Review Panel 34

Dr. John Butt 35

Dr. Jack Crane 36

Dr. Christopher Milroy 36

Dr. Helen Whitwell 37

Dr. Pekka Saukko 38

Dr. Smith's Involvement in the Chief Coroner's Review 38

The Review Process 38

Results of the Review 41

3 Establishment of the Commission	44
4 Investigation of Suspicious Pediatric Deaths	51
A Hypothetical Death Investigation: Toronto, 1997	52
The Initial Police Investigation	52
The Coroner's Initial Role	53
Role of the Pathologist and the Police at the Post-Mortem Examination	55
Role of the Police, the OCCO, and the Pathologist: From Completion of Report through Trial	58
5 Legislative Context	60
Positions Established by the <i>Coroners Act</i>	61
Duties and Powers of Coroners	62
The Work of the Office of the Chief Coroner for Ontario	64
6 The Science and Culture of Forensic Pathology	66
Forensic Pathology as an Evolving Science	69
Controversies in Forensic Pathology	71
The Interpretive Nature of Forensic Pathology	72
Interaction between Forensic Pathology and the Criminal Justice System	74
The Culture of Pediatric Forensic Pathology	76
A Note on Terminology	78
7 Organization of Pediatric Forensic Pathology	80
The Era of Dr. John Hillsdon Smith, Provincial Forensic Pathologist	80
Role and Mandate of the Forensic Pathology Branch	80
Relationship between the Provincial Forensic Pathologist and the OCCO	81
Training and Experience of Pathologists Performing Pediatric Coroner's Autopsies	82
Oversight by the Provincial Forensic Pathologist	83
Educational Programs	83
Lack of Policies and Guidelines Regarding Coroner's Autopsies	83
Oversight and Quality Control of Coroner's Cases	83
The Era of Dr. David Chiasson, Chief Forensic Pathologist	85
Responsibilities of and Relationship between the Chief Coroner and the Chief Forensic Pathologist	85
Staffing at the Provincial Forensic Pathology Unit	86
Creation of the Ontario Pediatric Forensic Pathology Unit	87
Appointment of Dr. Smith as Director of the OPFPU	89

Oversight and Accountability of the OPFPU	89
Unrealized Research Goals of the OPFPU	92
Attempted Re-visioning of the OPFPU	93
Regional Forensic Pathology Units	94
Establishment and Structures	94
Expertise of Pathologists	95
Oversight and Accountability Relationships	95
The Regional Coroner's Pathologist System	98
Lack of an Independent Complaints Mechanism	99
Steps Taken by Dr. Chiasson to Increase the Oversight of Pathologists' Work	99
Review of Reports of Post-Mortem Examination within the Provincial Forensic Pathology Unit	100
Review of Reports of Post-Mortem Examination in All Criminally Suspicious Cases	100
Spot Audit of Work of the OPFPU	102
Failure to Track Timeliness	102
Content of Reports of Post-Mortem Examination	103
Special Case Reviews	103
Consultative Support	104
Educational Activities	104
Review of Participation in Criminal Proceedings	104
Pediatric Forensic Hospital Rounds	105
Resignation of Dr. Chiasson	106
OCCO Response to Increasing Concerns about Child Abuse	108
Paediatric Death Review Committee	108
OCCO Policies and Pediatric Deaths	109
Memorandum 551(B)	109
Memorandum 616	110
The 1995 Infant Death Investigation Protocol	110
SIDS/SUDS Committee	113
Summary	113
8 Dr. Smith and the Practice of Pediatric Forensic Pathology	115
Training and Experience	116
Dr. Smith's Training	117
Dr. Smith's Experience	118
Consequences in the Cases of Valin, Sharon, and Jenna	120
The Post-Mortem Examination	126

Acquiring Information	127
Obtaining Relevant Information	128
Visiting the Scene	130
Disregarding Irrelevant and Prejudicial Information	130
Recording Information	132
Taking Notes of Information Provided Verbally	132
Recording the Pathologist's Actions	133
Preserving Autopsy Records	135
Autopsy Practice	139
Handling of Exhibits for Testing	142
The Pathology Opinion	144
Interpreting Artefacts	145
Diagnosing Asphyxia	148
Diagnosing Head Injury	152
Accounting for Contradictory Evidence	153
Use of Default Diagnosis	156
The Report of Post-Mortem Examination	158
The Limitations of Form 12 and Form 14	158
Limitations Related to History and Explanation	159
Limitations Related to Opinions	160
Limitations Related to Consultations with Other Experts	160
The Use of Parentheses	162
Inclusion of an Opinion on the Manner of Death	163
Reporting in a Timely Fashion	164
Pathologists' Interactions with Other Participants in the Criminal Justice System	171
Interaction with the Police at Autopsy	171
Ongoing Communication with the Police	174
Participation in the Justice System	178
Providing Evidence in Court	178
The Expert as Advocate	179
The Inadequately Prepared Expert	180
The Overstated Expertise of the Expert	181
The Expert and Unscientific Evidence	182
The Expert and Unbalanced Evidence	183
The Expert's Attacks on Colleagues	185
The Expert and Evidence beyond His Expertise	186
The Speculating Expert	187
The Expert and Casual Language	188

The Expert Who Misleads	188
The Role of an Expert in the Criminal Justice System before the Trial	189
Cooperating with Other Experts	191
Frustrating the Oversight Process	192
Misrepresentations about Justice Dunn	193
Misrepresentations about Report Delays	196
Misrepresentations in Response to Growing Concerns	197
Summary	201

9 Oversight of Pediatric Forensic Pathology 205

Introduction	205
OCCO Oversight of Dr. Smith	208
July 1991: Justice Dunn's Reasons for Judgment	208
May 1995: Crown Counsel's Concerns Regarding Dr. Smith	210
September 1996: Baby X's Case	211
February 1997: Dr. Young Learns of Justice Dunn's Criticisms	212
Mid- to Late 1990s: General Complaints about Dr. Smith	213
Summer 1997: Nicholas' Case	215
May 1998: The OCCO Asks the CPSO to Decline Jurisdiction to Investigate Dr. Smith	220
February to May 1999: Mr. Gagnon's Complaint to the Coroners' Council	222
February to May 1999: Sharon's Case	224
May 1999: Dr. Porter's Contrary Conclusion in Jenna's Case	226
July to September 1999: The Exhumation in Sharon's Case	227
November 1999: <i>the fifth estate</i> Program	229
March 2000: Mr. Gagnon Complains to the Solicitor General	231
January 22, 2001: Charge Stayed in Tyrell's Case	232
January 25, 2001: Charge Withdrawn in Sharon's Case	232
January 25, 2001: The OCCO Decision to Remove Dr. Smith	233
The 2001 Reviews	234
May 2001: The <i>Maclean's</i> Article	238
June 2001: The Carpenter Review – Dr. Smith Resumes Some Coroner's Autopsies	239
September 2001: The Report of the Ombudsman on Mr. Gagnon's Complaint	240
October 2001 to April 2002: The Hair in Jenna's Case	241
April 2002: Dr. Cairns Advises the CPSO and Dr. Young about the Hair in Jenna's Case	242
April 2002: Dr. Young Supports Dr. Smith to the CPSO	243

July 2002: Dr. Cairns Offers an Expert Pathology Opinion in Paolo's Case	244
November–December 2002: Dr. Smith's Confrontation with the OPP	246
The OCCO Response to the CPSO Decisions	246
June 2003: Charges Stayed in Athena's Case	248
December 2003: The OCCO Removes Dr. Smith from the Roster for Coroner's Autopsies	250
June 2004: The OCCO Removes Dr. Smith as Director of the OPFPU	251
Summary	252
The Role of SickKids	255
Failure to Share Information with the OCCO	258
The Role of the CPSO	259
The Complaints about Dr. Smith	259
Complaint in Amber's Case (D.M. Complaint)	259
Complaints in Nicholas' Case (Gagnon Complaint)	262
Complaint in Jenna's Case (Waudby Complaint)	263
Further Investigation and Decision of the CPSO in the Three Complaints	264
The New Era	267
The New Guidelines	268
An Evidence-Based, Objective Approach to Pediatric Forensic Pathology	268
Role of the Forensic Expert in the Criminal Justice System	269
The Autopsy Guidelines	269
The 2006 Protocol Regarding Deaths of Children under Five	270
The 2007 Autopsy Guidelines for Criminally Suspicious Pediatric Cases	270
Improvements in Peer Review and Quality Assurance	270
Death Investigation Communications Regarding Forensic Pathology	272
Policies and Oversight Mechanisms Regarding Timeliness of Reports	273
The Expertise of Pathologists Performing Autopsies	274
Development of Regional Forensic Pathology Units	275
Mechanisms for Review of Participation in the Justice System	276
Committee Development	277
Educational Activities	277
New Physical Facilities	277
Conclusion	278

Volume 3: Policy and Recommendations

Abbreviations and Acronyms xiii

Glossary of Medical Terms xv

10 Restoring Confidence in Pediatric Forensic Pathology	281
11 Professionalizing and Rebuilding Pediatric Forensic Pathology	284
12 Reorganizing Pediatric Forensic Pathology	308
13 Enhancing Oversight and Accountability	331
14 Improving the Complaints Process	363
15 Best Practices	372
16 Effective Communication with the Criminal Justice System	406
17 The Roles of Coroners, Police, Crown, and Defence	437
18 The Role of the Court	470
19 Pediatric Forensic Pathology and Potential Wrongful Convictions	514
20 First Nations and Remote Communities	546
21 Pediatric Forensic Pathology and Families	567
22 Conclusion and Consolidated Recommendations	588

Volume 4: Inquiry Process

23 The Scope and Approach of the Inquiry 635

Appendices 675

Commissioner and Inquiry Staff 985